



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/893,541	06/28/2001	Alex Cabanes	SVL920010028US1(IBM 2 001	4450
46158	7590	11/16/2007	EXAMINER	
Rankin, Hill, Porter & Clark, LLP			KE, PENG	
925 Euclid Avenue, Suite 700			ART UNIT	
Cleveland, OH 44115-1405			PAPER NUMBER	
			2174	
			MAIL DATE	
			DELIVERY MODE	
			11/16/2007	
			PAPER	

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

Commissioner for Patents
United States Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

**BEFORE THE BOARD OF PATENT APPEALS
AND INTERFERENCES**

Application Number: 09/893,541
Filing Date: June 28, 2001
Appellant(s): CABANES ET AL.

MAILED

NOV 16 2007

Technology Center 2100

Alex Cabanes
For Appellant

EXAMINER'S ANSWER

This is in response to the appeal brief filed 8/16/07 appealing from the Office action mailed 8/09/07.

(1) Real Party in Interest

A statement identifying by name the real party in interest is contained in the brief.

(2) Related Appeals and Interferences

The examiner is not aware of any related appeals, interferences, or judicial proceedings which will directly affect or be directly affected by or have a bearing on the Board's decision in the pending appeal.

(3) Status of Claims

The statement of the status of claims contained in the brief is correct.

(4) Status of Amendments After Final

The appellant's statement of the status of amendments after final rejection contained in the brief is correct.

(5) Summary of Claimed Subject Matter

The summary of claimed subject matter contained in the brief is correct.

(6) Grounds of Rejection to be Reviewed on Appeal

The appellant's statement of the grounds of rejection to be reviewed on appeal is correct.

(7) Claims Appendix

The copy of the appealed claims contained in the Appendix to the brief is correct.

(8) Evidence Relied Upon

6,499,026

Rivette et al.

12-2002

(9) Grounds of Rejection

The following ground(s) of rejection are applicable to the appealed claims:

Claim Rejections – 35 USC § 102

Art Unit: 2174

The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless –

(e) the invention was described in (1) an application for patent, published under section 122(b), by another filed in the United States before the invention by the applicant for patent or (2) a patent granted on an application for patent by another filed in the United States before the invention by the applicant for patent, except that an international application filed under the treaty defined in section 351(a) shall have the effects for purposes of this subsection of an application filed in the United States only if the international application designated the United States and was published under Article 21(2) of such treaty in the English language.

Claims 1-8, 10-12, 14-22, 24-26, and 28-44 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) as being anticipated by Rivette et al. US Patent 6,499,026.

As per claim 1, Rivette teaches a user interface method for executing one or more operations in a computer for interfacing an associated user with a knowledge portal that is operatively associated with a plurality of data objects, the user interface method comprising:

displaying in a document pane at least a portion of a first contents current object; (figure, 145A, item 14504, column 122, lines 45-68; figure 117, item 11706 “document window”; column 113, lines 65-column 115, lines 27: section “console”)

displaying in a map pane a K-map indicating objects which are cataloged in the knowledge portal as including content related to a selected K-map object; (figure 117, item 11710 “Group Window”, column 114, lines 40-46)

displaying in a preview pane third contents associated with a preview object selected from the K-map, wherein the document pane, map pane, and preview pane are distinct display areas that are displayed simultaneously on a single display device; (figure 117, item 11708, column 114, lines 48-58)

receiving a user input; updating, based upon the received user input, at least one of a first identity of said current object, a second identity of said preview object, and a K-map parameter;

Art Unit: 2174

and updating the K-map conditional upon the updating of a K-map parameter. (column 120, lines 8-62)

As per claim 2, Rivette teaches the user interface method as set forth in claim 1. Rivette further teaches wherein:

the of updating, based upon the received user input, at least one of a current object identity, a preview object identity, (figure 122, item 12204, column 120, lines 8-62) and

a K-map parameter includes updating a K-map view selector based upon the received user input to correspond to a node view; (figure 164, item 16412; column 129, lines 64-column 130, lines 30) and

the of displaying in a map pane the K-map includes displaying a non-hierarchical node view of the K-map. (figure 164, item 16412; column 129, lines 64-column 130, lines 30)

As per claim 3, Rivette teaches the user interface method as set forth in claim 1. Rivette further teaches wherein: the updating, based upon the received user input, at least one of a current object identity, a preview object identity, and a K-map parameter includes updating a K-map class selector value based upon the received user input; and

the updating a K-map conditional upon updating a K-map parameter includes updating the K-map to include objects corresponding to the K-map class selector value. (column 127, lines 6-35)

As per claim 4, Rivette teaches the user interface method as set forth in claim 3. Rivette further teaches wherein: the step of updating a K-map class selector value includes updating the K-map selector value to correspond to one of a people class, a places class, and a things class

Art Unit: 2174

based upon the received user input. (column 117, line 42-column 118, line 30, figure 163, item 16302)

As per claim 5, Rivette teaches the user interface method as set forth in claim 1, wherein: the updating, based upon the received user input, at least one of a current object identity, a preview object identity, and a K-map parameter includes updating a K-map scope based upon the received user input; and the updating the K-map conditional upon updating a K-map parameter includes updating the K-map to include objects which are cataloged in the knowledge portal as including fourth contents related to the K-map object and having a strength of relationship respective to the K-map object within the updated K-map scope. (column 127, lines 6-35, The number of links between one note to another is an indication of strength between one note to another)

As per claim 6, Rivette teaches the user interface method as set forth in claim 1. Rivette further teaches wherein:

the receiving a user input includes receiving a selection of an updated current object identity from the user through the K-map pane, the updated current object identity being one of the objects indicated in the map pane; (column 127, lines 6-35)

the updating; based upon the received user input, at least one of the current object identity, the preview object identity, (column 127, lines 6-35) and

a K-map parameter includes updating the K-map object to correspond with the updated current object; and the step of updating a K-map conditional upon updating a K-map parameter includes updating the K-map to include objects which are cataloged in the knowledge portal as including content related to the updated current object. (column 127, lines 6-35)

Art Unit: 2174

As per claim 7, Rivette teaches the user interface method as set forth in claim 1. Rivette teaches wherein the receiving a user input includes receiving a selection of an updated preview object identity from the user through the K-map pane, the selected object identity being one of the objects indicated in the map pane, the method further comprising:

displaying in the preview pane third contents associated with the updated preview object without changing the displaying in the document panel.(column 125, lines 40-column 126, lines 8)

As per claim 8, Rivette teaches the user interface method as set forth in claim 1. Rivette wherein:

the receiving a user input includes receiving a text entry through user highlighting of text in the document display pane; (column 118, lines 48-column 119,lines 44)

the updating, based upon the received user input, at least one of a current object identity, a preview object identity, and a K-map parameter includes updating the K-map object to correspond with the received text entry; (column 118, lines 48-column 119,lines 44) and

the updating a K-map conditional upon updating a K-map parameter includes updating the K-map to include objects which are cataloged in the knowledge portal as including content related to the selected text. (column 118, lines 48-column 119,lines 44)

As per claim 10, Rivette teaches an apparatus for executing one or more operations in a computer for interfacing an associated user with a knowledge portal operatively associated with a plurality of data objects, the apparatus comprising:

Art Unit: 2174

a computer having a data storage coupled thereto, wherein the data storage stores the plurality of data objects; (column 14, lines 54-column 15, lines 30), and

one or more computer programs, performed by the computer for receiving a user input,

updating, based upon the received user input, at least one of a current object identity, (column 127, lines 6-35)

a preview object identity, and a K-map parameter,

updating a K-map conditional upon updating a K-map parameter,

displaying in a document pane at least a portion of first contents of the current object, (column 118, lines 45-column 119 lines 44)

displaying in a map pane the K-map, and

displaying in a preview pane contents associated with the preview object. (column 120, lines 8-62)

As per claim 11, Rivette teaches the apparatus as set forth in claim 10. Rivette further teaches wherein:

the updating, based upon the received user input, at least one of a current object identity, a preview object identity, (column 127, lines 6-35) and

a K-map parameter includes updating the K-map view selector based upon the received user input the K-map view selector having at least a node view selection option (figure 164, item 16412; column 129, lines 64-column 130, lines 30) and a tree view selection option; (figure 117, item 11710 “Group Window”, column 114, lines 40-46) and

Art Unit: 2174

the displaying in a map pane the K-map includes selectively displaying one of a tree view and a node view of the K-map based upon the setting of the K-map view selector. (column 125, lines 40-column 126, lines 8)

As per claim 12, Rivette teaches the apparatus as set forth in claim 10, wherein:

the updating, based upon the received user input, at least one of a current object identity, a preview object identity, and a K-map parameter includes

updating the K-map class selector value based upon the received user input the class selector including at least a people class selection option,

a places class selection option. And

a things class selection option; and the step of updating a K-map conditional upon updating a K-map parameter includes updating the K-map to include objects corresponding to the K-map class selector value.(column 120, lines 8-62; figure 121, items “Inventor”, “assignees”, and “Patent #”);

As per claim 14, Rivette teaches the apparatus as set forth in claim 10. Rivette further teaches wherein:

the updating, based upon the received user input, at least one of a current object identity, a preview object identity, and a K-map parameter includes updating a K-map scope based upon the received user input; and (column 120, lines 8-62)

the updating a K-map conditional upon updating a K-map parameter includes updating the K-map to include objects within the K-map scope. (column 127, lines 6-35)

Art Unit: 2174

As per claim 15, Rivette teaches the apparatus as set forth in claim 10. Rivette further teaches wherein:

the receiving a user input includes receiving a selection of the current object identity from the user through the K-map pane; (column 127, lines 6-35)and

the updating a K-map conditional upon updating a K-map parameter includes updating the K-map to include objects related to the current object. (column 127, lines 6-35)

As per claim 16, Rivette teaches the apparatus as set forth in claim 10. Rivette further teaches wherein the receiving a user input includes receiving a selection of the preview object identity from the user through the K-map pane. (column 138, lines 52-column 139, lines 42)

As per claim 17, Rivette teaches the apparatus as set forth in claim 10. Rivette further teaches wherein:

the receiving a user input includes receiving a text entry supplied through user highlighting of text in the document display pane; (column 111, lines 44-column 112, line 52)

the updating, based upon the received user input, at least one of a current object identity, a preview object identity, and a K-map parameter includes updating an object K-map parameter to correspond with the received text entry; (column 127, lines 6-35)and

the updating a K-map conditional upon updating a K-map parameter includes updating the K-map to include objects related to the selected text. (column 127, lines 6-35)

As per claim 18, Rivette teaches the apparatus as set forth in claim 10, further including: simultaneously displaying the document pane, the map pane, and the preview pane on a single display device. (figure 117, item 11706 “document window”; column 113, lines 65-column 115, lines 27: section “console”)

As per claim 19, Rivette teaches an article of manufacture comprising
a program storage medium readable by a computer and embodying one or more
instructions executable by the computer to perform method executing an operation to perform a
user interface method for interfacing an associated user with a knowledge portal operatively
associated with a plurality of data objects, (column 14, lines 54-column 15, lines 30)

the method comprising the steps of generating a knowledge portal catalog cataloging data
objects based on content, the knowledge portal contextually linking the objects based on
document content; . (figure 117, item 11706 “document window”; column 113, lines 65-column
115, lines 27: section “console”)

displaying in a document pane at least a portion of first contents of a current a current
object; (column 118, lines 45-column 45)

constructing a K-map identifying related objects having second content related to a K-
map object as measured by a strength of relationship between the related object and the K-map
object; displaying in a map pane the K-map; (column 127, lines 6-35, The number of links
between one note to another is an indication of strength between one note to another) and

displaying in a preview pane third contents associated with a preview object selected
from the related objects, the preview pane being displayed simultaneously with the document
pane and the map pane. (figure 117, item 11706 “document window”; column 113, lines 65-
column 115, lines 27: section “console”)

As per claim 20, Rivette teaches (Previously presented) The article of manufacture as set
forth in claim 19, wherein: the step of displaying in a map pane the K-map includes displaying a
node view of the K-map limited to related objects having a strength of relationship respective to

Art Unit: 2174

the K-map object greater than a specified value. (column 127, lines 6-35, By limiting the displaying to a specific number of degrees, the K-map is limiting the displayed objects based on degree of the relevance)

As per claims 21 and 22, they are of the same scope as claims 3 and 4. Supra.

As per claim 24, Rivette teaches the article of manufacture as set forth in claim 19.

Rivette further teaches wherein the method further includes:

receiving a selection of an updated current object identity from the user through the K-map pane; (column 127, lines 6-35)

constructing an updated K-map that includes objects related to the updated current object; (column 127, lines 6-35)

displaying at least a portion of fourth contents of the updated current object in the document pane; and displaying the updated K-map in the map pane. (column 127, lines 6-35)

As per claim 25, Rivette teaches the article of manufacture as set forth in claim 19.

Rivette further teaches wherein the method further includes:

receiving a selection of the preview object identity from the user through the K-map pane. (column 118, lines 45-column 45)

As per claim 26, Rivette teaches the article of manufacture as set forth in claim 19.

Rivette further teaches wherein the method further includes:

receiving a text entry supplied through user highlighting of text in the document display pane; (column 127, lines 6-35)and

updating the K-map to include objects related to the selected text. (column 127, lines 6-35)

As per claim 28, Rivette teaches a user interface for interfacing an associated user with a knowledge portal that is operatively associated with a plurality of data objects and contextually links the objects based on document content, the user interface comprising:

a means for receiving a user input;

a K-map processor for calculating a K-map corresponding to a current object and a set of K-map parameters, the K-map identifying objects indicated by a catalog of the knowledge portal as having first contents related to the current object; (figure 117, item 11706 “document window”; column 113, lines 65-column 115, lines 27: section “console”)

a current object display pane for displaying at least a portion of the current object second contents ; a K-map display pane for displaying the K-map; (column 118, lines 45-column 119 lines 44)and

a preview pane different from the current object display pane for displaying third contents corresponding to a preview object. (figure 117, item 11706 “document window”; column 113, lines 65-column 115, lines 27: section “console”)

As per claim 29, which is dependent on claim 28, it is of the same scope as claim 2.
Supra.

As per claim 30, Rivette teaches the method of claim 28. Rivette further teaches the user interface as set forth in claim 28, wherein:

the K-map processor calculates a K-map containing objects limited to objects corresponding to the K-map class parameter. (column 117, line 42-column 118, line 30)

As per claim 31, Rivette teaches the user interface as set forth in claim 30, wherein:

Art Unit: 2174

the means for receiving a user input include a pointing device selection means operative at least within the K-map display pane; (column 127, lines 6-35) and

the class parameter is selectively updateable by the user via the pointing device selection means operating on a graphical class input dialog. (column 117, line 42-column 118, line 30)

As per claim 32, which is dependent on claim 30, it is of the same scope as claim 4.

Supra.

As per claim 33, which is dependent on claim 28. Rivette teaches the user interface as set forth in claim 28. Rivette further teaches wherein:

the set of K-map parameters includes a scope parameter; and

the K-map processor calculates a K-map containing objects limited to objects whose relationship to the current object falls within the scope parameter value. (column 117, lines 40-column 118, lines 30)

As per claim 34, which is dependent on claim 33. Rivette teaches the user interface as set forth in claim 33. Rivette further teaches wherein:

the means for receiving a user input include a pointing device selection means operative at least within the K-map display pane; (column 127, lines 6-35) and

the scope parameter is selectively updateable by the user via the pointing device selection means operating on a graphical scope input dialog. (column 127, lines 6-35)

As per claim 35, which is dependent on claim 34. Rivette teaches the user interface as set forth in claim 34, wherein the graphical scope input dialog is a slider bar. (column 115, lines 28-column 116, lines 42, section "console tool bar")

As per claim 36, which is dependent on claim 28. Rivette teaches the user interface as set forth in claim 28.

Rivette further teaches wherein: the means for receiving a user input include a pointing device selection means operative at least within the K-map display pane; (column 115, lines 28-column 116, lines 42, section “console tool bar”) and

the current object is selectively updateable by the user via the pointing device selection means operating within the K-map display pane, (column 115, lines 28-column 116, lines 42, section “console tool bar”)

As per claim 37, which is dependent on claim 28. Rivette teaches the user interface as set forth in claim 28, wherein:

the means for receiving a user input include a pointing device selection means operative at least within the K-map display pane; (column 127, lines 6-35) and

the preview object is selectively updateable by the user via the pointing device selection means operating within the K-map display pane, (column 118, lines 45-column 119 lines 44)

the updating of the preview object not affecting the current object display pane. (column 115, lines 28-column 116, lines 42, section “console tool bar”)

As per claim 38, Rivette teaches the user interface as set forth in claim 28. Rivette further teaches wherein:

the set of K-map parameters includes an object parameter, said object parameter being selectively updateable by the user; (column 115, lines 28-column 116, lines 42) and

the K-map processor calculates a K-map containing objects related to the object corresponding to the object parameter. (column 120, lines 8-62)

As per claim 39, Rivette teaches the user interface as set forth in claim 38. Rivette further teaches wherein:

the means for receiving a user input include a pointing device selection means operative at least within the document display pane whereby the user selectively updates the object parameter by selecting text corresponding thereto from the contents of the document display pane. (column 127, lines 6-35)

As per claim 40, Rivette teaches the user interface method as set forth in claim 7. Rivette further teaches wherein the preview pane contents associated with the updated preview object and displayed in the preview pane are metadata stored in the knowledge portal rather than in the preview object itself. (column 115, lines 28-column 116, lines 42)

As per claim 41, Rivette teaches the article of manufacture as set forth in claim 19, wherein the method further includes:

updating the K-map object to correspond to one of a group consisting of (i) a double-clicked K-map entry, (column 127, lines 6-35)

(ii) text in the document pane that is highlighted by a user, (figure 117, item 11706 “document window”; column 113, lines 65-column 115, lines 27: section “console”)

and

(iii) one or more search terms entered by a user; (column 120, lines 28-62)and

Art Unit: 2174

updating the displayed K-map to identify at least (i) related objects having content related to the updated K-map object, and (ii) a measure of a strength of relationship between each related object and the updated K-map object. (column 127, lines 6-35)

As per claim 42, Rivette teaches the user interface method as set forth in claim 1, wherein: Rivette further teaches the K-map parameter includes at one of a cope, a view selector, a class selection and a K-map object parameter. (column 117, line 42-column 118, line 30)

As per claims 43 and 44, they are of the same scope as claim 42. Supra.

(10) Response to Argument

A) Rivette fails to teach “displaying in a document pane at least a portion of first content of a current object, displaying in a map pane a K-map indicating object which are cataloged in the knowledge portal as including content related to a selected K-map object, and displaying a preview pane third content associated with a preview object selected from the K-map, wherein the document pane, map pane, and preview pane are displayed simultaneously on a single display device”

Rivette teaches “displaying in a document pane at least a portion of first content of a current object, displaying in a map pane a K-map indicating object which are cataloged in the knowledge portal as including content related to a selected K-map object, and displaying a preview pane third content associated with a preview object selected from the K-map, wherein the document pane, map pane, and preview pane are displayed simultaneously on a single display device” because its system can create all three panes and display them simultaneously together. (See Rivette figure 145 A, item 14504, “document window” is a document pane; figure

Art Unit: 2174

164 item 16404 and figure 117 and item 11710 “Group Window” are a K-map object; and figure 125, item 12504 and figure 148, item 14802 “image” are previews of the document).

A (1) Rivette teaches a document pane because in one of its display windows or panes the user can display an actual text document of the desired publication. (See Rivette figure 145 A, item 14504, “document window” is a document pane). The information displayed in the document window includes a portion if not all of the content, thus meeting this claim limitation.

A (2) Rivette teaches a K-map pane because the user can display a map of forward cited or backward cited documents in one pane (figure 164 item 16404 and figure 117); and display a tree map of documents that fall within the same category in another. (figure 117 and item 11710 “Group Window”) Both maps display relevant publications of the selected document. The diagram displayed in the cited map is a K-map, thus meeting this claim limitation.

A (3) Rivette teaches preview panes because users can preview document’s title, assignee, and inventor in one pane; (figure 125, item 12504) and preview an image of document in another. (figure 148, item 14802 “image” are previews of the document) The information displayed in the windows is preview content, thus meeting this claim limitation.

Finally, these panes and windows can be displayed simultaneously because each pane is a separate window where the display of one pane does not interfere with the display of another. As shown in figure 125, multiple separate panes can be displayed simultaneously. (see figure 125, items 11708, 12506, and 12524)

Art Unit: 2174

B) Rivette fails to teach “updating, based upon the received user input, at least one of a first identity of said current object, a second identity of said preview object, and a K-map parameter.”

Rivette teaches “updating, based upon the received user input, at least one of a first identity of said current object, a second identity of said preview object, and a K-map parameter” because not only does Rivette allow user to update what is being displayed on one of these panes, it allows user to update all the windows. (column 120, lines 8-62)

Rivette teaches updating the identity of currently selected objects based upon the users’ input because it allows user to choose what should be displayed on the text document pane. (see column 122, lines 1-45)

Rivette teaches updating the identity of the preview object based upon the users’ input because it allows the user to choose what should be displayed on the title pane; (see Rivette, col. 120, lines 10-40) and the image pane. (see Rivette, col. 125, lines 30-62).

Finally, Rivette teaches updating the K-map based on the users’ input because it allows the user to choose what is displayed on the forward/backward cited window; (see Rivette, col. 135, lines 55-col. 136, lines 20) and the tree map pane.(see Rivette, col. 116, lines 44-62)

C) Rivette fails to teaches “updating, based upon the received user input, at least one of a current object identity, a preview object identity, and a K-map parameter, includes updating the K-map view selector based upon the received user input to correspond to a node view...”

Examiner disagrees. Rivette teaches “updating, based upon the received user input, at least one of a current object identity, a preview object identity, and a K-map parameter, includes updating the K-map view selector based upon the received user input to correspond to a node

Art Unit: 2174

view...” because Rivette allows the users to update what is displayed on the document text window and the K-map map.

Rivette teaches updating the identity of the currently selected object based upon the users’ input because it allows the user to choose what should be displayed on the text document pane. (see column 122, lines 1-45)

Rivette teaches updating the identity of the preview object based upon the users’ input because it allows the user to choose what should be displayed on the title pane; (see Rivette, col. 120, lines 10-40) and one the image pane. (see Rivette, col. 125, lines 30-62)

Furthermore, Rivette teaches “updating a K-map view selector” because it allow the user to select either a forward citing or a backward citing on the citing map pane. (see Rivette, col. 135, lines 55-col. 136, lines 20)

D) Rivette fails to teach “updating a K-map parameter including updating the K-map to include objects corresponding to the K-map class selector value.”

Rivette teaches “updating a K-map parameter including updating the K-map to include objects corresponding to the K-map class selector value” because it allows the user to select either a forward citing or a backward citing on the citing map pane. And forward citation is a different class selector value than backward citation. (see Rivette, col. 135, lines 55-col. 136, lines 20)

E) Rivette fails to teach “updating a K-map class selector valued includes updating the K-map selector value to correspond to one of a people class, a places class, and a things class based upon the received user input.”

Art Unit: 2174

Rivette teaches “updating a K-map class selector valued includes updating the K-map selector value to correspond to one of a people class, a places class, and a things class based upon the received user input” because it allow user to select either a forward citing or a backward citing on the citing map pane. And forward citation and backward citation are selector value correspond to a things class. (see Rivette, col. 135, lines 55-col. 136, lines 20)

F) Rivette fails to teach “the number of links between one node to another is an indication of strength between one node to another.”

Rivette teaches “the number of links between one node to another is an indication of strength between one node to another” because it allows the user to select either a forward citing or a backward citing on the citing map pane. And the number of links between the original document and the cited document shows the strength citation. (see Rivette, figure 164, item 16404)

G) Rivette fails to teach “displaying in a preview pane third content associated with the update preview object without changing the display in the document panel.

Examiner disagrees because the user can change what is displayed on the title pane (figure 125, item 12504 is a preview pane) without changing what is displayed text document window, (See Rivette figure 145 A, item 14504, “document window” is a document pane;) because they are independent from each other. (see figure 125, items 11708, 12506, and 12524)

H) Rivette fails to teach “receiving a text entry through user highlighting of text in the document display pane.”

Art Unit: 2174

Examiner disagrees Rivette teaches “receiving a text entry through the user highlighting of text in the document display pane” because it allows users to highlight within the text document. (column 26, lines 20-28)

(11) Related Proceeding(s) Appendix

No decision rendered by a court or the Board is identified by the examiner in the Related Appeals and Interferences section of this examiner’s answer.

Art Unit: 2174

For the above reasons, it is believed that the rejections should be sustained.

Respectfully submitted,

Peng Ke

/Peng Ke/

Conferees:



Lynne H. Browne
Appeal Practice Specialist, TQAS
Technology Center 2100



John Cabeca
Supervisory Primary Examiner
Technology Center 2100